

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**Tourism in the New South Africa: Social Responsibility and the Tourist Experience. Garth Allen and Frank Brennan. London: I.B. Tauris, 2004. 305 pp.**

Social scientists, Garth Allen and Frank Brennan, have essentially created two interrelated books between the covers of *Tourism in the New South Africa: Social Responsibility and the Tourist Experience*. A social anthropologist and a political economist, the pair worked in South Africa from the mid-1990s to 2002. First, their joint effort is a hopeful yet cautionary tale concerning eco-tourism and development in the context of KwaZulu-Natal. Second, the authors lead readers on a winding path into the psyche of the international traveler, speculations on issues of international citizenship, and accountable tourist behavior. The text should interest scholars of South African studies, tourism studies, development studies, social anthropology, as well as political economy.

In the opening chapters, the authors present a highly detailed overview of South African tourism policy in the 1990s. Following the 1994 transition from apartheid, the state characterizes tourism as a panacea, fostering reconciliation, nation building, job creation, and economic growth. Additionally, Allen and Brennan present a more specific account of tourism development issues facing the northern region of KwaZulu-Natal (KZN). Encompassing national parks, estuaries, and wildlife areas, as well as many rural African communities, KZN is a prime location for extracting examples of eco-tourism development and its impact on local groups.

The authors' primary goal is to contribute to the literature on community-based ecotourism. In their view, the current discourse, often understandably weighted towards issues of conservation and sustainability, could benefit from a tinge of "realism." They assert that development planners need to better recognize the "tangles of vested interests and the political factors" that complicate the web of decision makers, stakeholders, and affected parties. To this end, the authors summarize and evaluate case studies of contemporary programs, such as those at Dukuduku Forest, Phinda Resource Reserve, and Kosi Bay in KZN. They identify and characterize the key participants and the strengths and weaknesses of each program. Their scrutiny is aimed at constructing improved, viable models of interaction between national offices, the private sector, and individual communities. Importantly, they stress the need for both environmental and cultural specificity when designing programs.

To further expose "tangles", Allen and Brennan pinpoint a number of realistic impediments to sustainable development initiatives in South Africa's rural areas. One prevalent and pertinent issue is the participation of local African groups. To begin, South Africa's history of institutional injustice towards blacks lingers over African communities and impedes their trust of new programs. A recently publicized concern for the nation, there is continued debate over who—the government, individuals, or the community—is the final decision maker concerning land ownership and use. Similarly, the authors question the struggle between community and personal interests. They ask: Is the self-determination and individualism lauded under the new free-capitalist and democratic South Africa fundamentally at odds with the equally lauded goals of community action and empowerment? In sum, Allen and Brennan characterize KZN as "unfertile ground" for development until these factors, along with crime

and political and ethnic turbulence, are addressed.

Seemingly fragmented from the initial discussion of ecotourism, the second section of the text directs its focus to the socially responsible vacationer. In an interesting turn, the authors address the moral and ethic dimension of tourism, expressly through the dilemmas presented to international tourists. Allen and Brennan speculate whether tourists should modify their individual behavior as guests of another nation. (This issue is also addressed by E. Chambers 2005 among others). They raise many questions related to toleration and obligation. In the South African case: should visitors abide or react to social injustice such as racism in the host countries? They also question what prompts some tourist behaviors: Do tourists make purchases out of a sense of compassion or compulsion to “give back” to the community they visit?

Despite the highly theoretical and conjectural nature of this section, the text offers several ideas worthy of further dialogue. For instance, they discuss how interactions between tourism bodies can venture towards greater goals, such as conservation. In this vein, Allen and Brennan make the case for an international code of conduct for travelers. Their argument contains a hypothetical discussion of the archetypal, “Good Tourist,” someone who will have the initiative to learn customs and act respectfully in travel situations despite encountering dissimilar norms and values. Conversely, Allen and Brennan tender a few problematic examples. For instance, they postulate that rumors of crime and violence dissuade visits to South Africa or restrict tourists’ activities while in South African cities. Though a valid concern, the authors offer few crime-related statistics and no personalized information from interviews with victims or non-victims. Their argument rests on a fictional character who is debating the consequences of leaving his hotel room after dark to visit the Durban beachfront.

For this reader, the text holds some weak points. First of all, the personalities of this section, a hedonistic jet-setter (reminiscent of the “Ugly American”), the “Good Tourist”, and the timid traveler, composite characters alike, are perhaps too generalized. Throughout the text, there is little discussion of methodology or direct quotation of informants. The analysis could be improved with more remarks on their current interviews and observations or more thorough unpacking of vignettes. Finally, despite engaging with issues of ethnic group participation, they neglect a thorough discussion of the impacts of cultural tourism that couple eco-tourism initiatives and certainly collide with new South African tourism policies.

The strength of this work lies in the authors’ appreciation of the nuanced character of tourism. Tourism is a dialectical social process. Combined with development, it is a further complicated network of political-economic factors, environments, and stakeholder groups. Admittedly, Allen and Brennan’s work is exploratory and offers more avenues for future research than definitive answers concerning either ecotourism development or social responsibility. In conclusion, it is the connections linking the two sections of the text, such as that between the altruistic tourist and their potential impact on programs of ecology and conservation, or that between good governance and good citizenship, which will allow for successful development programs in the future.

Rachel Harvey  
University of Florida

## Reference

Chambers, Erve. “Can the Anthropology of Tourism Make Us Better Travelers?” *NAPA Bulletin* 23, (2005): 27-44.

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**Uncertain Safari: Kenyan Encounters and African Dreams. Allan M. Winkler. Lanham, MD (USA): Hamilton Books, 2004. 149pp.**

It is always a pleasant surprise to find a book that is written about one's own experiences. Many of us have taught or studied in Africa, yet accounts of that experience are rare. There is a whole industry of Peace Corps books, some of them excellent (George Packer's *The Village of Waiting* [1984], about Togo, comes to mind). There are travel books, many of them covering East Africa, some of them self-indulgent, others works of literature (take the late Shiva Naipaul's delightful *North of South* [1978]). And there are journalist's accounts of their lives in Africa, often providing a thoughtful analysis (Blaine Harden may not have invented the term "Big Man," but his book *Africa: Dispatches from a Fragile Continent* [1990] certainly brought it to a wider audience. Accounts of the teacher's experience in Africa, however, are rare.

This makes Allan Winkler's book a useful contribution. Winkler taught as a Fulbright professor in the history department of the University of Nairobi in 1995-96, and has visited Kenya for extended periods since 1990. As he puts it in his preface, his book tries to capture his love for Kenya and is "meant as an affectionate portrait of people, places, and problems" (p. 6). While the book is honest and generally readable, it isn't entirely successful at conveying the author's affection for Kenya.

The book is structured as a series of relatively independent essays. While certain themes reappear as well as certain characters (Winkler's neighbor, Mary, a fellow instructor at the university, from whom he learns about the Kenyan social context), the chapters could stand on their own—and indeed perhaps they were originally written as separate essays. The chapter on education, "Teach the Children Well," is especially refreshing, as it recounts the experiences many of us have faced teaching in a foreign environment: the lack of materials, the classes cancelled for no apparent reason, the intelligent but, by American standards, passive students. For Winkler, his encounters are generalizable: "the crumbling infrastructure at the University of Nairobi...[was] typical of the country as a whole" (p. 44). He has shipped several hundred books, intending to donate them to the university library. With help from the American Embassy, the books are traced to a warehouse at the port of Mombasa and arrive in Nairobi. But given Winkler's experiences with the university library ("It was a mess" [p.52]), he decides to contribute the books to his department to create a library, but building a few bookshelves becomes an enormous undertaking:

The entire episode was a kind of microscopic study of the problems of trying to get things done in a developing country....The bureaucracy was almost impenetrable, dominated by officials afraid to take the initiative, for fear of committing too much, accomplishing too little, and losing their jobs (p. 53).

Winkler applies this approach to most of his experiences in Kenya: based on his personal experiences, he draws general conclusions. As a historian, he realizes the risks of this approach,

and in the chapter on corruption (“The Politics of Fear”) he supports his generalizations with interviews with the editor of the Daily Nation, Tom Mshindi, opposition leader Richard Leakey, and with former attorney general Charles Njonjo, forced out of office in a power play in the 1980s. Unfortunately, the only thing we learn from the latter interview is that Njonjo was “unwilling to talk about the carefully orchestrated attack...that had brought him down” (p. 110). One does get a feel for the way the country works—the byzantine machinations of politics and power—but like the teacher who only spends a year there, one is left wondering exactly what is going on.

Winkler blames the colonial experience for Kenya’s corruption and its failure to live up to its promise at independence. By implication, this applies to all of Africa:

One autocrat after another has drawn skillfully on the lessons of the colonial past and used the patterns of repression devised then to secure personal and political advantage in the post-independence years (p. 104).

While this is certainly true in many instances, it does not explain why corruption and inefficiency have percolated to all levels of Kenyan society, and Winkler doesn’t offer other suggestions. On President Moi, who finally “retired” in 2002, Winkler gives some nice one-liners (he finds it symbolic that the monument to Moi in Uhuru Park is in a state of disrepair [p. 108]), but ultimately he doesn’t tell anything new about Moi:

I felt myself caught up in this carefully cultivated charade....I had to give Moi grudging respect for the support he demanded and received, just as I had reluctantly applauded Lyndon Johnson when he imposed his will on the United States in the mid-1960s (p. 108).

The connection to Lyndon Johnson is never explained, and the non-sequitur is emblematic of the way Winkler throws together fascinating tidbits in this book. The result of this honest book is interesting, certainly to anyone who has taught or worked in Africa, but it never really brings Kenya to life.

Sören Johnson

*Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**No Peace, No War: An Anthropology of Contemporary Armed Conflicts. Paul Richards, ed. Athens, OH: Ohio University Press, 2005. 214 pp.**

**At War's End: Building Peace After Civil Conflict. Roland Paris. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. 290 pp.**

*No Peace, No War* and *At War's End* probe the nature of armed hostilities while paying close attention to their social context and process. It should be noted that despite their different methodologies and perspectives, both tomes speak simultaneously to scholars and practitioners of peacebuilding, and to others interested in the challenges of managing civil violence. In spite of the similarity of topics and their general treatment of the issues at hand, this review discusses each book in turn in order to better accentuate their import and potential.

Paul Richards' edited volume is the product of a research project on the anthropology of violent conflict. A comparative analysis of the chapters in this collection illustrate that the intent of the investigation is the unpacking of the concepts of war and peace from the load of meanings deposited on them by security experts and international relations scholars. The point of departure for the contributors is debunking the dominant media perception that rogue states and terrorist networks are causes rather than symptoms of the volatility of international life. In its execution of this objective *No Peace, No War* adopts the conceptual tool-kit of anthropological research. Consequently, such a novel take on the issue of contemporary armed conflicts makes possible a number of important conjectures on the relationship between war and peace.

The collection challenges its readers to think about war (and also peace) as aspects of social processes and not merely as the outcomes of a set of causes. This proposition is particularly pertinent to the post-Cold War conflicts, the overwhelming majority of which occurred within and not between states. Richards' volume locates such wars within the social context that nurtures them. This allows conflict to be conceptualized as "something made through social action, and something that can be moderated through social action rather than viewing it as so exceptional as to require 'special' explanatory effort" (p. 3). The utility of this argument is advanced in eleven essays on societies vulnerable to or affected by war. The following section concentrates on the treatment of the "African" cases, as they are likely of greater interest to the readers of this journal.

In this context, one should admire Sten Hagberg's perspicacious treatment of the volatile inter-ethnic peace in Burkina Faso. In an investigation which seeks to explain the persistence of the uneasy peace in the country, Hagberg draws attention away from the part played by the central authorities and external actors and instead focuses on the role of local administrations. He points that it is the functioning of local bureaucracy (sustained by regular payments of salaries) more than anything else that keeps the lid on civil unrest in the country. Hagberg's analysis contributes to the emerging literature linking post-Cold War civil conflicts (not only in Africa) to the breakdown of local administrations and in particular "the subsequent corruption of local dispute-resolution procedures" (p.

55). This point dovetails with Sverker Finnström's treatment of the conflict in Northern Uganda. Finnström embarks on a socio-linguistic examination, which he terms "knowing by engagements" (p. 98) of the interactive cultural and political practice of interpretation and counter-interpretation of the conflict by the various protagonists. The processes of marginalization due to the malfunctioning of state-institutions are at the heart of Caspar Fithen's and Paul Richards' study of the conflict in Sierra Leone. The authors emphasize the "operational failure of traditional group solidarities" (p. 117). The dissolution of these traditional social relationships in the country leads them to suggest the emergence of competing affinities organized around cultures of violence. The analysis of this chapter, however, could have greatly benefited from a comparison with similar studies of the wars in former Yugoslavia, which link the levels of violence to the ruin of social hierarchies. The difficulty to rebuild social solidarities is reiterated by Mats Utas in his chapter on the reintegration of Liberia's child-soldiers. Utas, like Finnström, emphasizes the importance of knowing and engaging the social environment in the process of peacebuilding.

A similar argument is advanced by Bjorn Lindgren in his essay on political violence in Zimbabwe. The thrust of his thesis is that conflicts never really end, but continue to live in the memories of violence and the reality of dislocation. Therefore, Lindgren points that sustainable peace projects require attention to the social accommodation of these experiences. Yet, despite the enlightened approach of these essays all of them pale in comparison with the closing exploration by the late Bernhard Helander on the long and complex war in Somalia. During the 1990s the country has become a poignant symbol for both political scientists and representatives of international institutions. Helander suggests that the failure of the peacebuilding initiatives in the country is due to their objective to resuscitate the state institutions so that peace can flourish. As the provocative title of his essay "Who Needs a State" suggests, Helander revisits the practices of local stateless societies by considering the delivery of social services in Northeast Somalia. In this respect, he makes an important contribution not only to understanding the process and context of modern conflict, but also adds to the growing literature on post-Westphalian statehood.

In these and many other ways, *No Peace, No War* provides a much-needed account of the role played by social processes in post-Cold War intra-state conflicts. It also invites readers to consider alternative ways for overcoming the dilemmas of state-failure and state-collapse. It is expected that some would object to the anthropological approach advanced by the volume; but even the detractors would have to admire the coherence and consistency with which it has been followed by the contributors. The collection would therefore appeal to the advanced student of international affairs and in particular to scholars exploring the issues of ethnic strife.

Dealing with the aftermath of violent conflicts is also the focus of Roland Paris' *At War's End*. His pragmatic objective is to suggest ways for making peacebuilding more effective. Paris considers this an essential requirement in countering the problems of civil conflict in the post-Cold War era. Unlike *No Peace, No War*, Paris' text utilizes the traditional conceptual tools of international relations theory and security studies. However, *At War's End*'s main finding would not surprise the contributors to Richards' volume. Paris proposes that peacebuilding is a "specific kind of social engineering, based on particular assumptions about how best to establish durable domestic peace" (p. 6). His claim then is that all major peacebuilding initiatives of the 1990s discounted this societal dimension in their work. Instead they focused on the twin-aspects of liberalization: democratization and marketization. The argument is that such peacebuilding practice is influenced by the ideas of the US President Woodrow Wilson.

Having conducted an ideational overview of the notion and practice of peacebuilding, Paris strikes at its foundation. He conjectures that instead of outright liberalization, the foremost objective of peacebuilding should be institutionalization – the construction of “effective political and economic institutions prior to implementing extensive liberalizing reforms” in order to “bolster the ‘conflict dampening’ qualities of societies” (p. 235). Such proposition might not seem exceptionally original, however due to Paris’ approach and methodology it differs qualitatively from the neo-Gramscian critique traditionally leveled at humanitarian interventions. In order to assert his claim, Paris revisits the fourteen peacekeeping operations conducted between 1989 and 1999. Again owing to considerations of relevance, the following section reviews the discussion of peacebuilding initiatives in Africa.

*At War’s End* sets off its evaluation of internationally-sponsored liberalization efforts with the cases of Angola and Rwanda. However, instead of recounting the failure of the peacebuilding endeavors in these countries, Paris embarks on a meticulous investigation of the actual reconstruction effort. His exploration provides circumstantial evidence that the liberalization initiatives may have actually worked against the establishment of stability. Likewise, in the comparative treatment of Cambodia and Liberia, Paris discerns a diversion of democratization process (at least) partially sustained by the peacebuilding effort. Liberia’s case in particular corroborates his claim that “hasty liberalization efforts might actually work against the goal of establishing a stable and lasting peace in countries that are just emerging from civil wars” (p. 96). Paris draws a similar conclusion in his treatment of the conflict in Sierra Leone. Like the contributors to *No Peace, No War*, he emphasizes the importance of knowing and engaging the social context in the promotion of sustainable peace initiatives. Probably, the main challenge to his hypothesis is posed by the cases of Namibia and Mozambique, which by and large tend to be considered as success stories of peacebuilding. Yet, Paris queries whether the effort there was of the same nature as in the other post-Cold War intra-state wars. He argues, therefore, the conflicts in Namibia and Mozambique were “not ‘civil’ wars at all” (p.148). Indeed, the wars there were both instigated and sustained by external actors. Paris displays that when the outsiders abandoned the battlefields, there was “little ‘demand’ for continued fighting, thereby reducing the risks of rapid liberalization exacerbating tensions among formerly warring parties” (p. 135).

Such overview of the peacebuilding efforts during the 1990s convinces Paris in the sensibility of establishing a system of domestic institutions capable of managing the disruptive effects of democratization and marketization. Perhaps, the only flaw in this line of argument is the lack of criteria for gauging the capability of these institutions. This definitely is an issue to be tackled by further research and *At War’s End* is undoubtedly going to inspire additional enquiries into its issues.

For scholars of post-Cold War affairs in the African continent both tomes offer a wealth of information and possible templates for examining the question of order. The virtue of both Richards’ and Paris’ volume is that they are not seeking to give definitive answers and impose perspectives, but inform, provoke and challenge their readers to explore new avenues in the explanation and the understanding of the conflicts of the 1990s. In this respect, *No Peace, No War* and *At War’s End* would be with us for quite a while both as an excellent reference source for scholars of conflict studies as well as a repository of knowledge for anyone interested in the process and the context of civil wars.

Emilian Kavalski  
Loughborough University, UK

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3  
Spring 2006

**The Politics of Humanitarian Organizations Intervention. Lanham. Obiagi Ndubisi. University of America Press, 2004. 120 pp.**

Interventions by humanitarian organizations in conflict settings are mainly premised on the moral principle and the unquestionable need to alleviate suffering among the distressed population. However, their altruistic interventions are contentious, challenging and potentially capable of negative and unintended consequences. In his short but critical book, Ndubisi Obiagi, a Professor of Politics at Fort Valley State University, investigates activities and roles of several humanitarian organizations responsible for relief operations in the famine stricken areas during the Nigerian Civil war of 1967-1970. Hypotheses guiding the study and well explored in the text include attempts by the humanitarian actors to influence behaviour of belligerent's leadership, legitimacy, psychological and material support given to the Biafra regime by the humanitarian organizations.

Chapter one explores the multifaceted debate on the nature of intervention by third parties in civil wars. Some of the contentious issues confronting humanitarianism and analysed by the author include the meaning of intervention, the relationship between non-intervention and neutrality, justifications, political nature and legitimacy of humanitarian interventions. In its broader meaning, intervention becomes inevitable with consequences of strict impartiality likely to be more deleterious. Non-intervention can encourage the stronger party in the conflict: "A great nation intervenes in the domestic realm of other states when it says 'yes' and when it says 'no', by its sheer existence," Obiagi writes. Obiagi understands intervention through motivational and consequential analysis. Motivational analysis consists of actions that are "consciously conceived to affect the authoritative structure of the target" while consequential analysis consists of a "policy which has unintended or inadvertent consequences, indistinguishable from the consequences of intervention", an example being the case where relief aid strengthened the Biafra regime.

In the second chapter, the author explores the historical perspective of the Civil war, the role and interests of various third parties in the conflict. Interaction of many forces is attributed to the origin of the conflict, with prominence given to ethnic rivalries and competition for state control among the Ibo, Yoruba and Hausa-Fulani, the three dominant ethnic blocs in Nigeria. He then gives reasons and sequence of events that eventually led to concerted demands for a Biafran state and declaration of Independence in May 30, 1967. Motivations by foreign business firms, nation states, international organizations and humanitarian groups were varied. For the business firms and nation states, economic rationale was dominant, with oil being the prime interest of oil companies such as the Shell-B.P, the American Gulf, and the French SAFRAP. Britain, the ex-colonial power, had the highest stakes in the crisis with an estimated 52% total investment in the country while France's investment totalled \$71.28 million. Further interest was stimulated by the 1967 Middle East war and the closure of the Suez Canal, factors that increased demand and



value of the Nigerian oil. Additionally, Nigeria had a geographical advantage since oil from Middle East required transportation around the Cape.

America remained neutral while Britain and Russia gave Lagos military support and backed the “One Nigeria” concept. China’s support for the Biafran cause was influenced by a global Sino- Soviet rivalry and strong dislike for Lagos pro-Western policies. Tanzania, Zambia, Gabon and Ivory Coast supported Biafra on humanitarian grounds although Obiaga notes that Nyerere’s support may have been a “political gambit to bring diplomatic pressure on President Gowon” to negotiate with rebels. The perceived fear of balkanisation and a continental security threat resulting from Biafra’s secession motivated most African states to support Lagos. Support from France, China, Zambia, Tanzania, Gabon and Ivory Coast and direct dealings of the U.S with secessionists in relation to humanitarian assistance strengthened the status of Biafra in its unsuccessful efforts to obtain international recognition.

In the last two chapters, Obiaga analyzes intervention, impacts, challenges and controversies that surrounded operations of the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) and Churches. A detailed analysis shows that despite their humanitarian acts and motivations, humanitarian organizations attempted to influence behaviour of the leadership and also provided rebels with psychological and material support. The Church and missionaries were biased, political and committed to the rebel’s political goal of self-determination. Obiaga also interrogates the dual interpretations of the Geneva Convention and demonstrates how it was used by the government to justify starvation as a weapon of war. The Chapters also highlights the problems of access, limited negotiation capacities and unintended consequences as some of the operational challenges facing humanitarian organizations in situations of civil strife.

In the conclusion, Obiaga asserts that humanitarian organizations, together with other third parties, acted as major propaganda tool for Biafra and prolonged the war through material and psychological support to the rebels and a toughening of the Lagos’ attitude. Moral obligation forces third parties to intervene in grave situations regardless of possible repercussions because consequences of non-intervention can be more deleterious than unintended consequences. Starvation in Biafra exemplifies such a situation.

Obiaga’s book is a welcome and an invaluable contribution to the academic debates and literature on humanitarian intervention. The analysis of Nigerian conflict and a well-selected bibliography adds a comparative value to the existing literature covering more recent complex emergencies in Somalia, Sudan, Ethiopia, Liberia and the Democratic Republic of Congo. It is a useful book for researchers, academics and students interested in African conflicts. Staff working with relief agencies will definitely find the book indispensable.

The book doesn’t exhaust the subject and this was not the author’s intent. Some areas that lack deeper analysis and might need further research include the role of mercenaries and strategies to mitigate the unintended consequence of humanitarian intervention, an understanding that is imperative in peace building and conflict resolution. Considering the books length and by giving too much space to the nation states and international organizations as third parties to the conflict, the author did injustice to the book’s title. One would expect a more in-depth analysis of humanitarian organizations. The book’s quality is also compromised by lack of thorough editorial work

Thomas N Kimaru  
*University of the Witwatersrand*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**A History of Inequality in South Africa, 1652–2002. Sampie Terreblanche. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press, 2002. 527 pp.**

Sampie Terreblanche has the erudition and unique insights into both sides of the political divide in South Africa to make him an excellent choice to attempt this ambitious book. A leading South African economist, he was until 1987 a member of the ruling National Party, the party of apartheid, but later became one of their fierce critic, becoming a founding member and economic adviser of the Democratic Party, while also being involved in clandestine meetings with the ANC in the 1980s.

At one level this book is a detailed economic and political history of South Africa. At another, it is a sustained critique, from a social democratic perspective, of the entire history and contemporary significance of inequality and globalization in a South African setting. This dual approach helps explain both the length and the complex structure of the book, which consists of four parts: “Power, Land, and Labour”; “The Transition and the ‘New South Africa (1990-2002)’”; “Colonialism, Segregation, and Apartheid (1652-1994)’”; and “An Incomplete Transformation: What’s To Be Done?” The book darts backwards and forwards in time. This structure, together with numerous cross-references and abbreviations, may irk some readers but accords with the author’s aim to write committed history and pose practical strategies for genuine transformation.

The book is based solely on secondary, rather than archival, sources and is intended as a broad synthesis, although Terreblanche was privy to some hidden facts on the transition period. On the “incomplete transformation” from 1994 he is adamant: enormous problems of poverty, health, land hunger, and lingering racism and exploitation remain. The question he poses is whether these challenges might have been better met by a more comprehensive, state-centered approach in the best tradition of European social democracy rather than over-reliance on building a “new black elite” wedded to neo-liberalism. In this regard, Terreblanche exposes the little-known informal meetings between white big business and ANC leaders that in the transition period allowed for a less overt economic victory of the Old Guard alongside an impressive political victory for the ANC (Terreblanche narrates this thesis in a new Canadian film, *Madiba: The Life & Times of Nelson Mandela* (CBC, 2004). Even if global trends have rendered radical options less realistic, it is a persuasive argument and one not without champions in the South African academy and even in some echelons of state power.

Terreblanche’s definition of, and elaboration on, the history of the “black elite” is at times somewhat simplistic: there is little, for example, on the complex historic ties between different black social strata. The black elite is treated as a passive end-product of entrapment by the white bourgeoisies and the new black “petit bourgeoisie” mysteriously uses trade union power (pp. 135-7). Even so, the focus on elites serves his purpose well. The more contemporary parts of the book compare favorably with other recent critiques of the status quo, such as Patrick Bond’s

*Elite Transition: From Apartheid to Neoliberalism in South Africa* (Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press, 2000). Terreblanche also criticizes the Truth and Reconciliation Commission for failing to confront systemic exploitation (p. 124). Despite some controversial formulations, for example the contention that affirmative action has fed black elitism (p. 136), he is always thought provoking. His Afrikaner establishment origins and an elision of the pantheon of African nationalist history leave him open to charges from such quarters that he downplays the ANC government's very considerable achievements. Yet the evidence of a long history of inequality is there in its historical "warts and all," and for this the author must be commended.

Although the author likes to think of this as primarily a history book, it is much more an engaged dialogue between past and present. Whilst some historians may begrudge the nuances lost through the author's inattention to archival research or fashionable trends in social history, Terreblanche's focus on inequality and on historical, rather than supposedly innate, causes of poverty (pp. 42-44), together with his own background, give this book greater potential, particularly among white South African readers, for impact beyond cloistered scholarly studies. And although the author is careful to acknowledge ANC achievements, it will be interesting to see the reception accorded the book in the black elite circles he trenchantly criticizes.

Generally, the author has made a solid attempt at analyzing the work of numerous scholars across an enormous span of 350 years to achieve his task of writing a history of inequality relevant to today's South Africa. Some notable authorities, such as Charles van Onselen, are strangely absent, but most of the usual suspects are discussed together with a representative host of new generation political economists such as Bond and Julian May, as well as works in Afrikaans. In emphasizing the continuing theme of economic exploitation and disempowerment of indigenous peoples by settler capitalism, Terreblanche joins the wide river of committed anti-apartheid scholarship typified by scholars such as Martin Legassick, Shula Marks, and Bernard Magubane, but he writes more in the provocative style of recent revisionist historians, if on a more sweeping scale.

Technically the book is well produced if arranged somewhat schematically. A baker's dozen of tables add quantitative value and ease the tedium of a long text, though they cover only the last century. Numerous other statistics also are adduced. We learn, for instance, that in a country crying out for urgent state services to confront HIV-AIDS and poverty, corporate taxation declined from 27% in 1976 to only 11% in 1999: a weak fiscal base for any transformation. Some tiny typographical errors have crept into the index: "Sizulu" for Sisulu and "Moshweshe" for Moshweshwe.

The deep and justified respect for liberation heroes of the Mandela generation will persist. So too will the need to know more about the history and significance of today's burning problems. This important and intensely compassionate book will aid that understanding and deserves wide readership among historians, sociologists, economists and political scientists—and also among the young white South Africans whom the author targets to make substantial sacrifices to tackle poverty (p. 5)—indeed all interested in South Africa should read, and act upon, this book.

Peter Limb  
*Michigan State University*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**Laduma! Soccer, Politics and Society in South Africa. Peter Alegi. Scottsville, South Africa: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press, 2004. 221 pp.**

Can soccer explain the world -or at least South African history?<sup>1</sup> Peter Alegi's ambitious, compelling and much anticipated *Laduma! Soccer, Politics and Society in South Africa* seeks to do the latter with great panache. Alegi brings South African popular and social history alive much as a deft mid-fielder would bring the ball alive in a soccer cup final. His analysis covers everything from aspects of African leisure time to trade unionism and from rural traditions of sport to the struggle for urban space. Alegi shows clearly the ways in which the sporting spectacle of soccer embodies not only the fault lines of race and class in South Africa, but also the ways in which Africans contested and shaped the very limited spaces available to them in their liberation struggle. In so doing, Alegi allows the reader to get caught up in his clear enthusiasm for the 'beautiful game'.

A critical question for South African history is of course where soccer fits in relation to other dominant forms of masculine leisure, identity, and white patriarchy. In this vein one can well imagine how many white colonial South Africans who became obsessed with rugby but not soccer, would have embraced Henry Blaha's oft quoted quip about the perceived differences between rugby and soccer: 'rugby is a beastly game played by gentlemen; soccer is a gentleman's game played by beasts....'<sup>2</sup> Given the historical importance of rugby to white South Africa, and the comparatively constrained place of African soccer such a false dichotomy captures some of the ways whites in South Africa emphasized and even celebrated perceived differences as they constructed their world of segregation and apartheid. Yet, as Alegi argues in *Laduma!* African soccer grew and thrived in South Africa despite these constraints.

Alegi sets out to expand on existing broader works on leisure time, sport and identity through his analysis of the history of what was primarily African soccer in South Africa, and he accomplishes much in this regard. Alegi shows how African soccer was built upon far more complex and sophisticated terrain than would first appear, even if the pitches that young African soccer players honed their skills on were of mud and dust. He situates the rise in popularity of soccer within the context of African athletic and martial traditions (chapter 1) and then explores the class and urban dimensions of the sport as it grew in the segregated cities of South Africa (chapter 3,4 and 5). Here, Alegi makes a significant contribution to African urban history by adding to our understanding of the way sports provided outlets for social, political and even economic associations in a society deeply divided by class and race. Perhaps the most compelling material comes in chapters 7 and 8 where Alegi contrasts the struggles of blacks to foster non-racial sporting in South Africa with the bald-faced racism of the dominant white sporting authorities.

There are also some fascinating team histories including detailed stories of the now famous Orlando Pirates (chapter 6) and accounts of the various African soccer leagues which struggled

to survive through the apartheid era. Alegi also gives consideration of the major playing styles; those adopted from abroad and those which originated in the African townships. Yet, there is perhaps less of interest here for die-hard soccer fans than for more serious academic historians. Indeed, Alegi has provided a vivid and captivating history based on very sound, extensive archival research and a multitude of interviews with fascinating characters from the world of South African soccer. He weaves both serious secondary scholarly sources in with references to popular media such as film and the celebrated magazine, *Drum*. He also provides a useful analysis of the relevant historiography, which is placed at the back of the book in an appendix, rather in the introductory material, and so do not help the reader frame his work at the start.

While *Laduma!* makes a significant contribution to our understanding of South African society during segregation and apartheid, I have some concern about the ways in which the book deals with gender and patriarchy. Alegi does acknowledge the very gendered ways that soccer developed (p.4 and p 55), and there is a brief discussion of women's involvement with supporters' clubs (pp. 127-28). He, moreover, argues that certain elements of the township culture surrounding gang violence, masculinity and identity are in need of further research (p. 94). Overall, however, he tends to shy away from a critical analysis of the ways in which the social dynamic of the male-dominated sport seemed to reinforce patterns of patriarchy. A more thoroughgoing look at the ways that the culture of soccer shaped not just male identities, but also male attitudes toward women and visa versa would have been helpful.

Despite these reservations, *Laduma!* is a welcome addition to the field of African history. It is a well researched, cogently argued work with crisp writing. Although some might be inclined to see the book as an attempt to overreach by ascribing so much significance to soccer in South Africa, at almost every turn, Alegi provides fresh insights which demonstrate just how significant soccer and leisure time are for understanding African history.

Aran MacKinnon  
*University of West Georgia*

## NOTES

1. For an ambitious but compelling effort at the former see Franklin Foer, *How Soccer Explains The World: An Unlikely Theory of Globalization* (New York Harper Collins, 2004).
2. There are many variations of this phrase with various attributions, but see W. Clark, *Rugby Quotes* (viewed at <http://wesclark.com/rrr/quotes.html>) For rugby see *The XVIth Man, Letters to Young Rugby Football Players* (Glasgow, Blackie and Son Ltd., 1907), p. 7 and for the South African dimension see A. Grundlingh, A. Odendaal and B. Spies, *Beyond The Tryline. Rugby and South African Society* (Johannesburg, Raven Press, 1995).

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**In Rwanda we say...The Family that does not speak dies (Video Documentary). Anne Aghion, Director. Brooklyn, NY: First Run-Icarus Films, 2004. 54 min.**

There has been much interest in the 1994 Genocide in Rwanda lately due to the ten year anniversary which was commemorated in April of 2004. Even Hollywood came out with a Rwandan themed film titled *Hotel Rwanda* to coincide with the anniversary. I think that this is a good development, and we should not let the genocide be forgotten lest it be repeated. The film *In Rwanda we say...The Family that does not speak dies* is not a big budget film like *Hotel Rwanda*, but it is a low budget documentary filmed on location which lets the survivors speak for themselves about their experiences ten years after the genocide took place. For that reason alone, it is a valuable document for students of the Rwandan genocide. The film is almost exclusively in Kirwanda, with English subtitles. This film is a sequel to the documentary "Gacaca, Living Together Again in Rwanda?" also directed by Aghion. This sequel begins with the release of hundreds of prisoners who had gone through the Gacaca court system, had confessed their crimes, and were pardoned.

The documentarians specifically follow the path of one Rwamfizi, a rural farmer from a village in the hills called Rubona. Rwamfizi tells his side of the story; which is that he was part of the Hutu night patrols who occasionally murdered people, but that he was falsely accused of killing specific people in Rubona. On the other side we have returned Tutsi men and Hutu widows who were married to slain Tutsi men who claim that Rwamfizi is a liar. It is impossible to know who is telling the truth here, ten years after the fact, and the filmmakers leave it to the audience to form their own opinions. Importantly, the survivors tell the film crew how *they* feel, except for when someone rattles off the official Rwandan government party line on reconciliation. Also telling, is how the film shows the divide between those willing to forgive and pardon, and those who refuse to reconcile with those they consider to be the former assassins of their families.

The widows also say "These whites ask us if we are happy.... These whites ask the strangest questions!" This brings up the issue of the role of the filmmakers. Their style is to remain out of sight. They want the story to tell itself from the mouths of the survivors. Yet this presents problems. The director never states what their reasons are for making the documentary, who invited them, and how they persuaded their informants to talk. This raises the following questions. Were these people paid? Did they fear not talking to the film crew? Did they fear straying off the official party line? And were the encounters between ex-prisoners and survivors drinking beer together in the local boutique staged for the camera when presented as everyday moments captured on film? Unfortunately, we don't know because the director never addresses these methodological questions. The other shortcoming of the film is that the background to the Rwandan genocide is not presented, so the uninitiated audience soon becomes confused about why the informants are acting certain ways and saying certain things. The filmmaker mistakenly

assumes a real knowledge of the background of the genocide on the part of the audience.

Secondly, the informants are only identified by their names, not as either Hutu or Tutsi. This may be in keeping with current official policy of the Rwandan government that all citizens are simply Rwandan, and there is no ethnic divide. However, if no informants are identified (except by their names) the audience has to guess based on their testimony whether they self-identify as either Hutu or Tutsi. Only then does the testimony begin to make sense. For example when one informant says “We must get along with them, they outnumber us”, the initiated know that he is talking as a Tutsi man, surrounded by a Hutu majority. Unfortunately, again for the uninitiated, it may be difficult to make these identifications independently.

Therefore in sum, this film is a valuable historical document. It should be viewed critically by students of the genocide. Other viewers will need some basic background knowledge to be able to make any sense of this film which is dialogue heavy, and in which the informants speak with many of the same assumptions concerning background understanding on behalf of the audience that the filmmakers seem to take for granted.

Timothy Nevin  
*University of Florida*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**'Letting Them Die': Why HIV/AIDS Prevention Programmes Fail. Catherine Campbell. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2003. 214pp.**

The HIV/AIDS epidemic continues to spread. Daily, the epidemic's toll is felt by families, communities, businesses and nations. For twenty-five years, within each of these levels, a variety of programs have been designed and implemented to strengthen prevention efforts. It has proven especially difficult to develop programs that incorporate a range of activities that will reach multiple audiences and address the multiple factors that place people at risk of HIV/AIDS.

Catherine Campbell's book is the most comprehensive review to date of one multi-faceted prevention program. I read the book shortly after talking with people in Namibia about their experiences with a workplace-based HIV/AIDS prevention program. The views of participants in that Namibia project closely echo the observations of Campbell about a community-based HIV/AIDS project in South Africa, the focus of this book. Her analysis of the many elements that determine the effectiveness of an HIV/AIDS project is applicable to many projects across Africa. Unfortunately, too, her conclusions that even well-resourced projects often fail to achieve their goals—and fail to stem the epidemic—are widely applicable. The question, then, is why, after a quarter of a century, have national and international responses to the epidemic achieved so little? Campbell's study goes a long-way toward answering this question.

Campbell moves her analysis beyond what has been the center of most HIV/AIDS projects: the focus on changing individual sexual behaviors. She looks at the mix of social, economic and policy determinants of sexual behavior within the context of one community-based HIV/AIDS prevention project. She seeks to show how the initial conceptual framework that informs project design and implementation leads to success or failure at subsequent stages of the project. She argues that HIV/AIDS projects need to be formulated with an understanding of the economic and social pressures that exist at and on local communities. At the same time, those projects must recognize that gender, class and social power relationships will shape how a project is perceived and manipulated by members of communities.

One of most insightful sections deals with the project's efforts to involve in the project women who sell sex. The women were recruited to be peer educators. They were expected to interact with other sex workers, with clients and community members to raise awareness about HIV/AIDS and promote prevention. All of the women were poor, had little control over their work and had no experience as facilitators for change. A lengthy process of recruitment and training occurred. The process was hindered by the power of a community "Chief" who sought to gain financially from the project. Eventually, the obstructionist "Chief" was killed and replaced by a younger man who promoted greater democratic involvement in community affairs. Over time, the role of women—and the project's peer educators—was enhanced by this turn of events.



Campbell argues at that both community and national levels, project participants must feel they have a voice in decision-making processes. The peer educators gained a level of that confidence through the respect they achieved. But, the channels for participation were relatively narrow. As with the peer educators I observed in Namibia, the efforts of those described by Campbell were limited by the gaps that occurred early in the project's conceptual and design stages.

Creating and implementing multi-dimensional projects are not easy tasks, particularly given the implosion of many public health systems, the skepticism of communities toward promises of improvements in living conditions, and the options available to both women and men to make a living in contemporary Africa. Unlike many of the international and national agencies focused on HIV/AIDS issues, Campbell does not argue that more money is the initial requisite for improved projects. In essence, her analysis argues for design teams with broader perspectives than has been the case to date. In turn, improved design of HIV/AIDS programs will take into account a wider range of disciplines and the lessons they have learned. Indeed, one is struck in Campbell's assessment and in reviewing other HIV/AIDS programs how little has been learned and applied from the experiences of fifty years of community development work.

The book offers many valuable insights for HIV/AIDS planners and practitioners. One would ask of Campbell to distill her analysis into a shorter, more concise format that will be read and used by the people who now shape HIV/AIDS programs.

Bill Rau  
*Takoma Park, MD*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**In and Out of Focus: Images from Central Africa, 1885-1960. Christaud Geary. London: Philip Wilson, 2002. 128 pp.**

This book, based on a wonderful exhibit originally organized at the National Museum of African Art in Washington, has insightful approaches to evaluating the ways Europeans and Africans created, transmitted, and employed photographic images for varied ends. Geary describes the formation of a Central African “image world” where photographers, publishers, subjects, and consumers all sought to produce and control images that often proved far more long-lived than the reputation of the photographers. To counteract the anonymity of most photographers in colonial Africa, Geary worked with Polish scholar Krzysztof Pluskota to examine the oeuvre of Polish photographer Casimir Zagourski, who worked from 1924 until 1944 in Léopoldville (Kinshasa), the capital of the Belgian Congo.

The author does an outstanding job of placing his subjects in a range of historical contexts: the technical and artistic development of photography, the history of colonial Central Africa, and the complex relationship between anthropology and images in the twentieth century. Geary begins with a short essay, “A World of Images,” that sets up the main themes of the entire work and introduces readers to the formation of colonial photographic styles, especially the “type” image that essentialized ethnic identities. He then gives an overview of the images disseminated in Europe about Central Africa, especially the Belgian Congo. In his masterful review of images produced in the era of Leopold II’s notorious Congo Free State, he shows how both the opponents and supporters of Leopold II deployed images of violence and ethnic “types” in their discussions. Officials posed Africans in “traditional” scenes along with abetting the creation of photographs celebrating economic and educational benefits of colonization. Some African photographers in the Free State, such as Herzekiah Andrew Shanu, saw their careers ruined once they joined in the protests against Leopold II. Still others, such as Frederick Starr (the first anthropologist at the University of Chicago), defended the Free States usage of staged images of “untouched Africa.”

After the Belgian government took the colony over shortly before World War I, images continued to play a key role in how Central Africa was understood. Changing technology altered the types of photographs that were produced, as postcards lost popularity and new journals like *L’Illustration Congolaise* introduced readers to the Belgian Congo. Tourists, whether they were members of the Belgian royal family or foreigners in search of adventure, sought out “traditional” African types. Africans, especially chiefs favored by the colonial state, responded to others’ expectations by encouraging tourists to take photographs. Geary notes how images of Mangbetu women from northern Congo appeared on stamps, travel books, and postcards. Mangbetu leaders knew that their guests expected to see hairstyles and clothes based on decades-old photographs and learned to change from Western style dress to “traditional” outfits and to carefully stage what they wanted visitors to photograph.

Pluskota and Geary devote two chapters to Zagourski. The authors uncovered a wide range of photographs and biographical information gleaned from family interviews, state archives, and personal letters. Zagourski appears as neither a stooge of colonial propaganda nor a selfless photographer defending indigenous ways of life, but a complicated man seeking to build a reputation and capturing the ethnographic present on film. He came to Africa at the age of 40 in 1924, for reasons the authors have difficulty discovering, and ran a photography studio for the next two decades. Zagourski proved to be a skillful businessman who sold elaborate albums and sought money from the colonial government to continue making photographs and films. His artistic creations drew from the common belief of “salvage anthropology” which held that indigenous cultures needed to be caught on film before they vanished. Though these images often appear staged, they are still stunning to see.

Of course, Africans too were photographers and people who wished to be filmed. Accordingly, the last chapter explores their craft in Central Africa. African subjects were not docile props, but actively took part in how they would appear. Turn of the century portraits taken by Africans show the self-representations of a coastal urban elite that enjoyed following conventions of European family photography. For example, Tutsi royal leaders seeking to prop up their legitimacy found photographs one way of displaying their power and connection to a tradition they actively helped construct. Geary also provides a brief but impressive collection of biographies of African photographers as well as examples of their works.

This book is a joy to look at, and has the potential to be quite useful in upper-level undergraduate and graduate courses in art history, imperialism, and African studies courses. First, it combines careful archival research with a beautiful set of images that can be used to examine how images were produced about Africa. Second, the study offers a nuanced view of image making that would compliment broader themes of colonial rule and the artful construction of “customary” practices. For classes that deal with the Congo Free State, this book makes an intriguing text to assign with Adam Hochschild’s *King Leopold’s Ghost*. Finally, it recapitulates in succinct and skillful prose much of the recent literature on colonial photography.

There are a few quibbles one could have with this excellent book. Missionaries as photographers rarely enter the discussion, despite the tremendous amount of images they produced. For a book on Central Africa, it is surprising that Gabon, a place where African photographers worked from the 1870s onward, does not receive much coverage. Finally, the references to Frederick Starr suggest the anthropologist mistakenly used violent imagery that worked against Starr’s goal of defending Leopold II. This was no accident; Starr was an anti-imperialist who thought violence inevitably came with conquest, but placed the blame for brutality on African soldiers working for Leopold instead of the colonial government’s own policies. Starr’s photographs of chained prisoners could be interpreted as proof that Leopold II was trying to restrain the supposedly unavoidable cruelty that came with colonization. Despite these minor criticisms, do not hesitate to read this beautiful study.

Jeremy Rich  
*University of Maine at Machias*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**The Syntax of Chichewa. Sam Mchombo. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. 149 pp.**

*The Syntax of Chichewa* is a thorough description of Chichewa syntactic structures. It is informed by extensive research based on various aspects of African languages, in particular Bantu languages. This book is very impressive in that in addition to describing Chichewa syntactic structures, the author creatively addresses the different interfaces: between phonology and morphology, phonology and syntax and morphology and syntax. Additionally, the various contributions of the study of African languages to linguistic theory are highlighted. Instead of restricting himself to a particular theoretical framework, the author provides an elaborate description based on a diversity of theoretical approaches. This is achieved through an analysis of areas such as phonetics and phonology, clause structure, relative clauses, argument structure and linguistic processes in the verb domain.

The introductory chapter provides an overview of the Bantu language family and places Chichewa in three Southern African countries. In addition the chapter provides general demographics of the language. Chapter one also outlines the general features of Chichewa while providing the various proposals to account for the status of noun prefixes in Chichewa and Bantu languages in general. Through the description of the phonological system of Chichewa, the author shows the relevance of tone to syntactic configurations. In particular this interaction between tone and relative-clause formation is explored in detail in chapter 2 and 4. The author also discusses stress assignment and highlights areas that may require further research within the area of tone (p. 16).

The discussion on clause structure (chapter three) is particularly interesting because it highlights the role of tone in determining the relation of the external noun phrase (NP) to the verb since this cannot be accounted for by its structural position or government. The author also mentions comparable analysis of the treatment and status of the object markers in other languages such as Kirundi and Kihaya. Chapter three closes with a discussion of modals and how they differ from verbal suffixes.

Chapter four provides an elaborate description of nominal complementation, in particular the relative clause. The role of relative clause in cleft and question formation is also described in detail. In addition, the author discusses the various roles of the subject marker and object marker in relative clause formation. In this chapter, the author provides an excellent example of the application of linguistic theory to provide a unified analysis. Additionally, the author poses questions that may be of interest to scholars working with other languages that are related to Chichewa.

Chapters five and six deal with the morphology of the verb stem. The author discusses verbal extensions in detail. Also, the author also talks about the status of pre-verb-stem morphemes and contrasts these with post verb-stem morphemes and provides a tree to represent the verb in

Chichewa (p.70). Mchombo further discusses the much debated issue of the ordering of verbal suffixes in Bantu and provides some of the questions that guided research in this area in Bantu languages.

The concluding chapter outlines some of the linguistic processes associated with the verb-stem. These include reduplication, compounding and nominal derivation. The author also discusses how various theoretical approaches have attempted to account for morpheme ordering in Bantu. Mchombo makes reference to Mirror Principle, Templatic Morphology and Thematic Roles and provides brief historical accounts of each approach.

Overall, the book is clearly arranged and written in an accessible style. It provides data from a variety of languages that may be used in cross-linguistic studies or within Bantu languages. In addition, the book provides examples of how to apply and test theory in less researched languages, a skill that is beneficial for linguistic students interested in Bantu languages. *The Syntax of Chichewa* would be a valuable teaching/learning resource for students of Bantu linguistics.

Mantua Rose Smouse  
*University of Florida*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**Energy Services for the Urban Poor in Africa: Issues and Policy Implications. Kebede, Bereket and Ikhupuleng Dube (eds.). London: Zed Books, Ltd in association with African Energy Policy Research Network (AFREPREN), Nairobi, Kenya, 2004. 297pp.**

*Energy Services* is a compilation of country case studies designed to address the challenge of providing the ever-growing urban poor population on the continent with modern energy services such as electricity and kerosene that would replace traditional biomass based fuels such as wood and charcoal. The cases come from the SADC region (Zambia and Zimbabwe) and from East Africa (Ethiopia, Uganda, and Tanzania). In order to make cross-country comparisons and draw more general conclusions each case study was to address five broad areas: 1) the extent to which the poor can afford modern energy services; 2) the role of upfront costs in providing modern energy services to the poor; 3) the extent to which energy subsidies targeted toward the poor actually reach the poor; 4) the impact of energy subsidies on government finances; and 5) the impact of the current system of electricity tariffs on small and micro enterprises (SMEs). Each case study then offers policy recommendations based on the study's findings.

Most of the case studies are quite detailed in terms of the data used, with most of the data are derived from government agencies, state-owned utilities, or through surveys. The amount and detail of the data used were quite surprising given the known difficulties with obtaining the necessary data, or the reliability of the data. I find this especially true of the Zambian case where I have knowledge of data problems with the state-owned electric utility ZESCO at their most recent price review proceeding. Moreover, the use of survey data was also relied upon quite heavily in the Zambian and Ethiopian cases, and should make any reader question the validity of the data used to reach some of the over-arching conclusions. Only in one case study (Tanzania) was there a truly open acknowledgement of the aforementioned data problems.

Some of the over-arching findings of the studies may be surprising to Africa watchers, especially with respect to affordability. The first is that the urban poor can afford unsubsidized energy services. The second finding, related to the first, is that the poor cannot afford to pay for the upfront costs associated with consuming modern energy services such as electricity connections, house wiring, stoves, lamps, etc. Consequently, many of the cases recommend subsidizing the up-front costs rather than subsidizing consumption, as has traditionally been the case in pro-poor policies, or to amortize the cost of the up-front investment by consumers over a period of years noting the current practice would require the poor to pay the up-front costs as a lump-sum payment. These findings and recommendations are similar to the findings and recommendations of World Bank and UN studies on serving the poor in places such as Latin America and South Asia.

A third general finding indicates most subsidies for energy consumption are NOT captured by the poor! This is also consistent with findings from other studies from around the developing world. The reason subsidies end up benefiting the non-poor is because they are subsidies on

consumption, as mentioned above, not on connection or up-front costs. Therefore, anybody who is connected receives the subsidy (usually non-poor), but the poor who have trouble affording the up-front costs are excluded. This result further bolsters the recommendation for subsidizing up-front costs.

The impact of subsidies on government finances is not so clear cut. However, the reader is left wondering what constitutes “government” and there was no consistent measure of the impact on the fiscal health of government across cases. The general impression is that subsidies have little impact on public finance as evidenced by cost-reflective and revenue sufficient tariffs in Ethiopia and the less than 5% impact in Tanzania. However, the subsidies in electricity in Zambia and Zimbabwe have been debilitating to the state owned companies and while they do not necessarily constitute government spending, the large company deficits are clearly a long-run burden on those governments. The authors should have provided more consistency here.

Overall, the book is well done and it accomplishes the goals set forth by the editors of the compilation, in spite of the data limitations and data questions, and verifies that providing energy services to the poor in Africa is financially viable if the best possible policies are implemented. Moreover, it reinforces, in the African context, what has been found in other parts of the world with respect to energy service provision for the poor. It is a must read for anybody working in development and energy in Africa including and especially World Bank and IMF professionals as well as government policy makers in Africa. There are many other smaller lessons that can be drawn from the cases presented, other than those provided above, and that could be applied with appropriate modifications to change policy in the local context.

Paul M. Sotkiewicz  
*University of Florida*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3  
Spring 2006

**Continent of Mothers, Continent of Hope: Understanding and Promoting Development in Africa Today. Skard Torild. New York: Zed Books Ltd., 2003. 260 pp.**

In this book, Skard draws on her rich experience working and living in Central and West Africa to recount the complex social, economic and political realities in the region. Skard carefully analyzes the overall development implications of conflicts, illiteracy and epidemics such as HIV/AIDS and malaria, with particular emphasis on women and girls. She reveals a wide range of institutional, ideological and cultural issues that have bearings on the ways in which development assistance has been undertaken in the region. Ultimately, the book is about effective and ineffective development interventions in Africa. The book argues for an unbiased and targeted development approach that ought to take into account the prevailing social, historical, cultural and political realities.

The discourse swings back and forth in history, from the slave trade and colonial exploitation to de-colonization and post independence governance, carefully scrutinizing their contribution to the prevailing crises in the region whilst analyzing their implications for meeting development objectives in the future. By drawing attention to some of the most deadly and brutal civil wars in the region and highlighting the appallingly violent attributes of these conflicts, Skard not only recounts the past but also challenges readers to ponder the future of Africa. For example, she briefly touches upon a crucial, and yet paradoxical aspect of peace building: the practice of rewarding rebels in an effort to end violence as was done in Liberia with Charles Taylor (p.19). Simultaneously, Skard reveals Africa's remarkable resilience amidst lawlessness, injustice, poverty, disease, and oppression. In particular, she sheds light on the often-understated role of women in courageously upholding the fracturing social fabric as a result of enduring hardships. Consequently, the book argues well for the meaningful and deliberate inclusion of women in the development process if peace and prosperity are to prevail.

Furthermore, Skard underscores the importance of fully appreciating the dynamics between traditional and modern values in the region before introducing new development approaches. Such understanding ensures that one builds on indigenous and positive practices rather than re-inventing the wheel. Skard supports this argument with examples of successful community and local initiatives such as Lemden Women's Cooperative in the arid Brakna region of Mauritania, which was founded in 1985 by local educated women (p.235). Despite the harsh environment and strong traditional and religious influences, the Women's Cooperative brought remarkable socio-economic and environmental improvements to Lemden village. Skard applauds the initiative and argues that with the necessary financial and technical support, such types of initiatives could transform the continent, even in areas dominated by men and tradition.

Drawing on personal experience, Skard makes note of a few successful development interventions in Central and West Africa sponsored by UNICEF. At the same time, she gives a detailed account of her leadership and managerial challenges within UNICEF that, in her view,



reflected a clash of culture between Westerners and Africans (p. 207; 208). Skard's interpretation of cultural clash seems to be confused with an institutional culture that, in my view, better represents the challenges described by Skard. For instance, problems associated with the local staff include the inability to dissociate business from personal affairs, nepotism and unpunctuality. The fact that the private sector operates within the same environment and cultural constraints and yet does not suffer from the same problems points to the institutional not cultural value of accountability and purposeful leadership. Just as the private sector adheres to these values to stay in business, the public sector can impart them to their host community as part of the development package rather than giving their tacit endorsement to unacceptable practices (p. 208).

Skard's attempt to pull together a wide range of peace and development issues in Central and West Africa in a succinct and engaging fashion is certainly the strength of this book. However, due to the sheer number of themes covered in this limited volume, some of the key points are addressed in an abrupt and superficial fashion including the underlying theme of the book - women and mothers in Africa. Furthermore, the book suffers from broad generalizations concerning 'Africans' and their 'culture' often based on isolated incidents, specific geographic locations, institutional culture and the decisions of unelected officials. This results in an incomplete and at times inaccurate portrayal of Africans and their diverse culture and history. For instance, Skard claims that in sub-Saharan Africa, Islam has spread from the north while Christianity came much later and penetrated slowly from the south (p. 184). This generalization is altogether erroneous when one examines the history of Ethiopia, a country that accepted Christianity in the fourth-century and has an ancient civilization including its own written language, still in official use. Despite criticizing donors for their lack of sophistication in handling diverse and complex development issues in Africa and the Western media for their stereotyped image of the continent, Skard is not immune to her own accusations. Although a few generalizations can be made regarding certain themes in Africa such as issues of governance and economic status, not to mention race, it is not only hypocritical but also intellectually shallow to generalize Africans with respect to their various cultures, religions, histories and civilizations.

Nevertheless, the book is particularly insightful for young and committed development professionals who are dedicated to fighting poverty and the unacceptable level of violence that still rages on the continent. Moreover, Skard's expert account of development politics and what it has and has not changed on the continent should be a good resource for researchers and junior and seasoned development professionals alike. While it will introduce new professionals to the complex world of development, it will provoke discussion and debate among others with more experience.

Makeda Tsegaye  
Nairobi, Kenya

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**The French Encounter with Africans: White Response to Blacks, 1530-1880. William B. Cohen. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2003. 360 pp.**

*The French Encounter with Africans* provides a review of French thinking about race and slavery as it developed from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century. Cohen's book emerged in response to three studies of the Anglo-Saxon image of Blacks: Curtin's *The Image of Africa* (1964), Jordan's *White Over Black: American Attitudes Toward the Negro* (1969) and Fredrickson's *The Black Image in the White Mind: The Debate on Afro-American Character and Destiny* (1971). Cohen's study was intended to constitute a French-focused examination of the image of Blacks, but instead generated unprecedented attention when reviewed in *Le Monde* by Emmanuel Todd who attacked the central thesis of the study: that there existed a consensus in French thought, which relegated the Black to a position of inferiority. So violent was Todd's attack on Cohen's study that it was taken as further evidence of the French reluctance to engage with the race question.

Taking a revisionist approach, Cohen challenges the reputation that France had gained for itself for being a country incapable of race and color prejudice; a perception that was so widely held, he argues, that it had come to form an integral part of the French self-image. Tracing the inequality of Blacks and Whites back to ideas inherited from the Classical world, in the first five chapters of the study Cohen explores the foundations of slavery, the ways in which it was justified, and its development. He goes on to chart the rise of imperialism as well as the demands for the abolition of slavery through emancipation in the nineteenth century, hesitation over which Cohen attributes to deep underlying doubts about Blacks. Chapter eight is a key chapter, which explores scientific racism and the ascendance of race thinking, the culmination of centuries of hostility towards Blacks that found its expression in language borrowed from the biological sciences. The progressive expansion of French Empire, explored in the final chapter of the volume, continued to present Africans as passive, reinforcing existing images of Blacks. In Cohen's words, "Imperialism did not cause any reassessment of Blacks, but rather helped to preserve the negative images that had existed since the earliest stages of Franco-African contact" (283).

The first edition of this once groundbreaking and now classic book was published in 1980, and it is surprising that it has only recently been published in paperback. Although the present edition is identical to the original, the addition of a foreword by Professor Le Sueur of the University of Nebraska provides not only a valuable overview of the text, highlighting its central thesis, but also an appreciation of Cohen's life and achievements as a scholar. Cohen received his PhD from Stanford University and spent his entire academic career at the University of Indiana, serving as Chair of the Department of History for part of that time. Cohen's first two books *Rulers of Empire* and *European Empire Building* addressed the French colonial service in

twentieth-century Africa. He then turned to the study of earlier times, which led to the publication of this volume in 1980. The present edition was published shortly after his death in 2002.

*The French Encounter with Africans* is clearly written, well structured and detailed without being too dense, making it accessible to a broad readership. Although Cohen's book lacks a bibliography, extensive endnotes provide clarification on points of interest, as well as references. Cohen's approach was controversial when the book first appeared, but the new lines of inquiry initiated by Cohen have since been followed up in the writings of other prominent historians, most notably Tzvetan Todorov. Cohen's ideas are now widely used and accepted, making *The French Encounter with Africans* an important point of reference for both academics and students.

Charlotte Baker  
University of Nottingham, UK

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**Counter-Colonial Criminology: A Critique of Imperialist Reason. Biko Agozino. London: Pluto, 2003. 281 pp.**

This book will undoubtedly provide much discussion in criminological circles, but it should not be confined to such a narrow field. Indeed, Biko Agozino has ushered forth a call, among other things, for former European colonies of Europe to adopt a new criminological theory to aid in the liberation of millions from human misery. According to the author, presently "...there is no single such [Criminology] department in the numerous universities in Africa (except in South Africa), the Caribbean, Asia and, to a lesser extent, South America" (9). He warns African and other former colonial nations, however, not to imitate the "mother countries'" criminology apparatuses that are steeped in imperialistic philosophy and practice. For Agozino, western criminological technology has either directly or indirectly stifled the development of those very societies in colonial, postcolonial, and even post-postcolonial times.

Moreover, he contends that western criminologists need to adopt a less arrogant approach to criminology by listening to the voices of the voiceless and powerless from past and present. At its base, the book is bold and iconoclastic. Because of this it is refreshing to read and very informative. The author pulls no punches in his critique of western imperialism as it has intersected and defined much of the so-called Third World's judicial systems. Agozino writes:

Criminology was developed primarily as a tool for imperialist domination and it continues to operate largely as a repressive technology. Other technologies of domination crafted by imperialism, such as the army, the police and the prison, have been generally appropriated by neocolonial regimes around the world. (228)

Agozino is particularly critical of the dearth in western criminological insights into contemporary forms of imperialism and human subordination due to the continued hegemony of the West. Criminological theory tends to emanate from the metropolises of the West and this negatively influences the empowerment of the disempowered—who tend to be most often, but not exclusively, people of color.

What makes *Counter-Colonial Criminology: A Critique of Imperialist Reason* an interesting and informative read is its use of an interdisciplinary perspective, or what Agozino deems as "a transdisciplinary theoretico-methodological intervention" (1). Thirteen chapters, plus an incisive foreword from Stephen Pfohl, and an elaborate conclusion make up the structure of the book. The topics range from a critique of The Enlightenment and Euro-American Theories of the Judicial Process, to Feminist Perspectives and Critical Criminology, to Executive Lawlessness and the Struggle for Democracy in Africa, to an analysis of the late reggae star Peter Tosh. Crucially, Agozino offers a wide-ranging and eclectic scholarly work that is unequivocally "counter-colonial" in its approach. It will no doubt irk the sensibilities of those scholars embedded in European canons and white-approaches to criminological discourse, which are currently the staple diet in most university courses.

In regard to chapter twelve, most Americans will probably not be very familiar with the analysis of Stephen Lawrence, the case of a young middle class black British male murdered by five racist young men in England (April 22, 1993). It is a powerful chapter that interacts with the public inquiry report into the killing, along with James Baldwin, and key theoretical perspectives, including: Marxism, Functionalism, Rationalism and Poststructuralism. A useful table (198) helps the reader situate the theories and writers that adhere to such schools of thought. This will be particularly useful to both undergraduates and graduates.

However, although I am in full agreement with Agozino's overall critique of westernized notions and practice of criminology and its claim to "objective" science that does very little to enable the powerless to attain justice, he still does not fully "escape" the Eurocentric canon. To put it another way, there is a strong and admirable attempt by Agozino to disassociate himself from the theoretical quagmire of Eurocentric discourse, but there is not enough engagement with alternative schools of thought, particularly from the perspective of Africans. Yes, there are the contributions of Nkrumah, Cabral, Fanon, Sivanandan, Hall, Davis, hooks and other black theorists, but most of these scholars were, or are, either Marxist and/or black Feminist. What about scholars who want to research African culture and social experience without the ghost of Karl Marx hanging on their shoulder? Or those like Clenora Hudson-Weems who seek an Africana womanist rather than feminist approach to social theory? This, however, is merely constructive criticism that should enhance in due course, I would hope, Agozino's already laudable theoretical position. Indeed, he admits that his research will need further exploration (247) and contemplation, provided that he can obtain the funding for such counter-hegemonic research endeavors in these draconian conservative times.

Overall, this is a book that deserves to be on all criminological reading lists, and it would be at home in any African centered studies course. It offers a generous amount of scholarly inquiry into an area that has paid scant attention to African and other "people of color's" perspectives in the criminological discourse. It is therefore groundbreaking and a must read.

Mark Christian  
*Miami University, Ohio*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**African Francophone Cinema. Samba Diop. New Orleans: University Press of the South, 2004. 106 pp.**

**Africa Shoots Back: Alternative Perspectives in Sub-Saharan African Film. Melissa Thackway. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. Oxford: Oxford, UK: James Currey, Ltd. Capetown, South Africa: David Philip, 2003. 230 pp.**

Samba Diop's *African Francophone Cinema* is destined for students who have an interest in francophone-African cinema, although Diop does not specify for which educational level it is appropriate. Given its traditional thematic approach and the limited number of films it discusses, I would limit its use to undergraduate introductory courses in film, or as an introduction for the uninitiated scholar. Melissa Thackway's *Africa Shoots Back* is both more ambitious in scope and more successful in its presentation. Although Thackway gives adequate attention to the African narrative traditions and themes outlined briefly in Diop's book, she goes beyond them to acknowledge francophone-African filmmakers for their innovation in style and technique.

She explores how African directors create their own artistic vision, rejecting the restrictive notion of "African cinema." Thackway illustrates convincingly how these filmmakers incorporate traditional images and practices from Africa in their films when beneficial to an understanding of their people, but how they eschew stereotypical images of Africa imposed by the West.

Diop organizes her book by theme—history, oral tradition, myth, religion, gender and sexuality, and postcolonialism—and much of what the book purports to achieve is contained in its summary introduction and conclusion. The body of the book analyzes in some detail films based on their central themes; for example, *Ceddo*, by Ousmane Sembène (Senegal), is used as the backdrop for a general discussion of the history of francophone-African cinema; *La genèse*, by Cheich Oumar Sissoko (Mali), illustrates the role of religion. Such an approach is valid, and there is much good thematic analysis of the films. However, Diop also promises to discuss cinematic technique, but there is very little about it in this text, and she inevitably returns to themes as major points of discussion.

In contrast, Thackway discusses traditional, thematic approaches while also acknowledging the technique and concerns of African directors independent of their categorization as African filmmakers. In her useful introduction Thackway challenges the qualification of Sub-Saharan Africa into linguistic categories—anglophone, francophone, and lusophone—rightly arguing that these distinctions are convenient colonial constructs, but that a minority of the peoples of these regions actually uses European languages with any regularity. Her argument is more lengthy and detailed than Diop's cursory discussion of "diglossia," in which native African languages are used alongside European ones in African cinema. Thackway explains that the term "francophone" refers to a common socio-political heritage, rather than as proof of the primacy of

France as a cultural reference. She is concerned with the traditional preoccupations often delineated in this type of text—themes that she refers to as “representation, identity and voice”—but she enlarges this view to explain how African filmmakers challenge European stereotypes and empower their audiences through the filmic medium. Her chapters are well organized and detailed. In the first chapter, she situates African film in its broader, predominantly European context, and illustrates how current critical cinematic theory may be applied to African cinema. In chapter 2 she explores representation, identity, and voice—how filmmakers use the medium to affirm African identity while challenging negative Western stereotypes. Chapter 3 shows how filmmakers’ cultural identity is developed and how elements of African oral tradition are integrated into film. Chapter 4 is a discussion of memory and history in which the author illustrates how colonial powers repressed or misrepresented African history, and how African directors reappropriate their history and interpret it from an African perspective. Chapter 5 contains an important, but often overlooked, aspect of francophone African film—African films set in Europe, which give audiences a view of the immigrant experience and explore the notion of African identity rarely treated in film, either African or European. Chapter 6 gives women in film their rightful due, exploring themes of empowerment in films by both female and male directors. Special attention is given to three prominent women directors—Safi Faye (Senegal), Anne Laure Folly (Togo), and Fanta Régina Nacro (Burkina Faso).

Diop devotes several paragraphs to problems of production and distribution among francophone-African filmmakers—again, an important point. Receiving little or no funding from their country of origin, these filmmakers must seek financing through the French Minister of Cooperation, and in many cases, what is asked of them by the French government is “authenticity,” which means depicting scenes of agricultural life, indigenous spiritual and cultural rituals, and native dance and music. In other words, it is difficult and sometimes controversial for African artists to depict more modern concerns—post-colonial political and economic strife, the AIDS epidemic, and loss of cultural identity. However, much of this information seems anecdotal, and the text itself is poorly organized and referenced. Long lists of filmmakers and their countries are given in the introductory chapter instead of as a filmography at the end of the text. The filmography that is given at the end includes only the 15 films actually discussed in the text, and then referenced only by director’s name and title of film. It would be helpful to have the country of origin here for quick reference. A short discussion of women filmmakers—Sarah Maldoror (Guadeloupe) and Flora Gomes (Guineau-Bissau) is included in the second chapter on history, but it seems an afterthought or a duty fulfilled, after nearly the entire chapter is devoted to Ousmane Sembène (an important pioneer in African cinema, no doubt). Certain subject groupings are curious and confusing. Why, for example, does Diop include “New Aesthetics” (ostensibly a discussion of directorial technique, distribution, and production) in a chapter largely devoted to gender and homosexuality? Although as stated above, Diop does a creditable job of illustrating themes, some of his analyses are obvious, even to the uninitiated student or scholar, such as when she comments that “...a distinction between documentaries and fiction must be made as the two do not necessarily play similar roles” (66).

The difference between the two books in terms of source material and references is telling. Diop provides nearly ninety sources, but in roughly one quarter of these (many of them journal articles) no date of publication is given, making them difficult to find if one chooses to conduct further research. No still photos of the films are included, which might help to illustrate some of the thematic discussions and spark interest in viewing the films discussed. Thackway, on the

other hand, is thorough and painstaking in her references. She includes an extensive filmography (well over 100 films are discussed in her text), including details such as country of origin, distributors, running time, and medium. The bibliography of reference works is detailed and up to date, and includes a wealth of sources for further study. Since these films are sometimes not easy to find, most helpful is the contact information for major distributors of francophone-African films included at the end. Reference notes appear in the right margins of each page (which I found less distracting than footnotes but more easily accessible than endnotes), and there are dozens of movie stills and reproductions of movie posters to illustrate technical points and key thematic elements. As an introduction to francophone-African cinema, Diop's text is sufficient in spite of its weaknesses, whereas Thackway's text is an excellent source in every regard—as an introduction to the subject, as a reference for serious scholars, and as an assigned text in an undergraduate or graduate course.

Patrick Day

*University of Wisconsin - Eau Claire*



# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3  
Spring 2006

**Phases of Conflict in Africa. Rose Kadende-Kaiser and Paul J. Kaiser, eds. Toronto: De Sitter Publications, 2005. 184 pp.**

Africa has been afflicted by serious armed conflicts perhaps more than any other region on the planet. It is however important to put the causes of these conflicts into proper perspective, rather than simply concluding that they are tribal or ethnic conflicts. In most cases, the underlying causes of these conflicts are closely interwoven in both national and international arenas. Among the international factors are the consequences of the Cold War and its aftermath, as well as the globalization and liberalization of the world economy, which have generated political and economic insecurity in Africa. National factors that have contributed to armed conflicts in Africa include discriminatory political processes, skewed resource distribution, centralized and highly personalized forms of governance, corruption, and mismanagement. In practice, attention to these conflicts is usually at the individual country level and in the contexts of specific countries. The consequence is that conflict resolution strategies fail to appreciate the complex, often regional, nature of conflicts in Africa. This book aims to provide an analytical framework for conceptualising and dealing with some of these conflicts, particularly in West and Central Africa.

The book initially considers the critical issue of terrorism and the way it has affected Africa. The emphasis in the discussion is on the factors that serve to mobilise actors toward the use of violence. The book points out that the underlying causes of terrorism should be sought in social and political injustices and in patterns of inequality. The war on terrorism therefore requires more than armed invasions. It calls for cooperation in attacking despair and indignities that spawn radical political measures and violence. The book maintains that the United States priority has been to reduce the threat of terrorism against American interests at home and abroad, but that there are costs involved and opportunities that African governments can exploit. The bottom line is that Africa should seek to strike more advantageous bargains with the United States by negotiating for the strengthening of governmental institutions to fight terrorism. The book also warns of the dangers of the war against terrorism diverting American attention from economic development and democratisation.

This volume also underscores the historical and cultural factors in the exacerbation of conflicts in Africa. It cites the case of Northern Ghana that witnessed conflicts between 1981 and 1994. These conflicts were an extension of the failure of the post colonial government to reconstruct citizenship in away that balanced ethnic interests. The post colonial government instead marginalized some groups which in turn aggravated conflict between ethnic groups. Most conflicts in Africa are in part informed by traditional legacies of skewed socio-economic and political relationships.

The refugee problem in Africa is another crucial factor linked to conflicts. The text argues that conflicts do not simply spill across boundaries because of movement of refugees. Instead, conflicts arise when refugees enter into a polarized situation or one that already contains the

seeds of discord. In such cases refugees create tensions by creating new alignments or changing old ones. The cases of Tanzania and the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) are used in the book to illustrate this situation. The historical polarity and movement of refugees in eastern DRC helps to explain the tension and conflicts in that country in the recent past. In Tanzania similar historical circumstances do not pertain and that partly explains why Tanzania has not witnessed violent conflicts involving refugees. The book also deals with the scope of the conflicts in the DRC since independence, illustrating the role of both the regional and trans-national forces.

In the case of West Africa, the book examines the case of Liberia and maintains that while a peace agreement can lay a foundation under which overt war may cease, it is the efforts to consolidate the peace agreement that determine whether that agreement will last or not. It is important to build on peace agreements by paying close attention to the vulnerabilities that each party brings to the negotiating table. The book also considers the question of transitional justice in Sierra Leone. Sierra Leone adopted two transitional justice policy options: a Truth Commission and a Special Court. In the recent past, countries that have emerged from conflict or gross human rights abuses have increasingly shown interest in adopting a variety of policy. The book cautions against embracing a 'one size fits it all' approach. It maintains the need to tailor policy options to specific contexts.

The book does well in broadly highlighting the complex nature of most of the conflicts on the African continent. It takes in diverse methodological approaches and ideological assumptions and certainly adds to critical thinking by providing fascinating and factual case studies. Each chapter challenges the reader to rethink the conventional simplistic way of branding conflicts in Africa in tribal/ethnic terms. What perhaps does not come out strongly in the essays on terrorism is the debate on the role of religion in conflicts, particularly where individuals seek to legitimise barbarism in the name of belief. Religion has also worked in tandem with socio economic factors to intensify conflicts in some parts of Africa, including Northern Uganda and Southern Sudan. The book also defines conflict in broad terms of perceived incompatibility of interests or competitions for control of scarce resources. Yet in the cases covered, there is little effort to distinguish these from overt and structural but insidious forms of conflict in countries such as Zimbabwe, Kenya and Nigeria. Nonetheless, the book is richly relevant to contemporary readers in its ability to highlight complex debates and borrow from diverse sources of data. The various contributors can each stand on their own but they also build on each other. It is a well packaged book on some key cases of destructive conflict in Africa. It should interest both academicians and practitioners interested in intellectual development, dialogue, and practice on conflict broadly and on Africa in particular.

Kisiangani Emmanuel  
*University of the Witwatersrand*

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3

Spring 2006

**Swahili Modernities. Culture, Politics, and Identity on the East Coast of Africa. Pat Caplan and Farouk Topan, eds. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 2004. 270 pp.**

A photograph of a young woman wearing a greenish veil and holding a mobile phone to her right ear adorns the cover of "Swahili Modernities", a collection of conference contributions dealing with "Culture, Politics and Identity on the East Coast of Africa". It should be pointed out that the modernity in the title refers to a much longer period of time than the cover-picture suggests, the most obvious example being José Arturo Saavedra's chapter on the incorporation of foreign words into Swahili poetry written between 1880 and 1907.

The plural, "Swahili Modernities" reflects not only the many forms in which modernity manifests itself on the East African Coast at various times, but also the diversity of approaches used by the contributors to the volume who have their background - with the exception of Greg Cameron, who is a political scientist - either in language and literature studies or anthropology. The case studies covers almost all of the Swahili Coast with Lamu as the most northern site of research and the Comoro islands the most southern, passing Bagamoyo, Zanzibar and Mafia island.

The book is well structured, although the headings of the three sub-sections "From Malindi to the Comoros: Local-level Case Studies of Swahili Modernities" (chapters 2-6), "Focus on Zanzibar" (chapters 7-9) and "Modernities and Identities in Swahili Texts: Poetry, Songs and Plays" (chapters 10-13) which are given on the homepage to the book have gone missing in the book itself.<sup>1</sup>

In the introductory chapter Caplan defines what modernity means in the context of the history of the Swahili Coast, by summarizing the main threads of discussion between the conference participants who were faced with two main challenges: to make clear that the coast of East Africa "has long been an area of perpetual change" (p.3) and to show that "the relationship between modernity and tradition is far from being an either/or matter." (p. 5). As the editors state in their preface, they aimed to explore "the impact of recent historical changes on the East Coast: globalization and its concomitant, localization; development and under-development; political changes, conflict and contests; and local understandings of and strivings towards the elusive goal of modernity" (viii) – an aim which they definitely accomplished with this volume.

The elusive character of modernity is at the center of Caplan's own case study on Mafia island for which she employed a creative approach. As her last visit dates back to 1994, Caplan uses the many letters sent to her since then, to analyze the changes which the island has undergone in the period of structural adjustment. She discusses how people deal with the increasing financial demands, which go hand in hand with modernization and also reflects on how these demands translate into requests for financial support placed upon herself, the anthropologist (p. 51) In her conclusion Caplan cautions against "exaggerating the success of coping strategies or romanticizing resistance" (p. 58) which is taking up a great deal of recent

literature on development and modernity and - having known the area for over three decades – takes a much more pessimistic outlook when she states: “In the context of Mafia Island, and indeed, I suspect, of much of the rest of sub-Saharan Africa, the odds are just overwhelming [...] The fact is that people die needlessly and people’s lives are much harder than they should be. Modernity remains elusive” (p. 58-59). In the second, also very stimulating, case study on Mafia island, Christine J. Walley explores notions of the meaning of development to the people on Mafia and contrasts them with the understanding of development by the different actors within the development-business.

Greg Cameron’s „Political Violence, Ethnicity and the Agrarian Question in Zanzibar“ is the first of two chapters which deal with the recent political conflict between the ruling Chama cha Mapinduzi (CCM) party and the Civic United Front (CUF) opposition which also took violent forms such as the demonstrations most notably in the January 2001 where many CUF supporters lost their lives in shootings. He convincingly argues that “the origins of Zanzibar’s contemporary political crisis derived from the agrarian crisis manifested in Pemba’s regional isolation, rather than a reassertion of Arab hegemonic designs on the Isles” (p. 112). This position is partly challenged by Kjersti Larsen’s chapter which is based on observations and conversations during extensive fieldwork in Zanzibar from the mid-eighties on.

The authors who deal with cultural expressions of Swahili identity generally offer more positive perspectives. Assibi A. Amidu describes Swahili poetry as a means to fight out political struggles in Lamu, while Paul Musau discusses how innovations on various levels have changed Taarab from a non-participatory form of music revolving around the main topic love, to a music-style which encourages the participation of its audience and which also addresses socio-political issues such as corruption, education and HIV/AIDS. The only chapter with an explicit gender focus is Farouk Topan’s analysis of the, representations of Female Status in Swahili Literature. Having traced changes in three pieces of Swahili literature which have been produced in different periods of time, he concludes that, “the attitude of men towards issues of gender” which on the level of literature manifests itself on the number of male writers who take “a stand against the exploitation of women” is a decisive factor. (p. 224-225)

All twelve chapters are relatively short and generally read well although there are substantial differences with regards to their quality and originality. Some authors remain very much on the surface of their topic and a more selective editing policy could have improved this collection. Despite these shortcomings the book certainly is of great value to anybody with an interest in the contemporary Swahili Coast and the way its inhabitants face and construct the complexities of modernities.

Birgit Englert  
*University of Vienna*

#### Note

1. See <http://www.goldsmiths.ac.uk/departments/anthropology/staff/pat-caplan/swahili-modernities.php>

# African Studies Quarterly

Volume 8, Issue 3  
Spring 2006

**Peoples' Spaces and State Spaces: Land and Governance in Mozambique. Rosemary Elizabeth Galli. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2003. 313 pp.**

*Peoples' Spaces and State Spaces* examines the ways in which Mozambicans have lost land rights and have been left out of the meaningful decision-making with regard to land management decision-making process. The scenario is a familiar one for Africa. Colonial powers vied for the region and carved it up in ways which did not correspond to customary land tenure regimes. Concessionary companies overwork and brutalize people causing many to flee in order to seek more meaningful employment to pay the high taxes newly imposed upon them. The social consequences of flooding and drought take on new dimensions due to changes in governance which fail to make rural people and their livelihoods a priority. Resettlement schemes and the establishment of wildlife protected areas bring new hardships to rural people. The post-independence government continues many of the practices established during colonial rule, but governance is less transparent and corruption commonplace.

The book is divided into two parts. Part one introduces the reader to the organization of rural space and the specifics of life in several small settlements. Documents from the historical archives of Mozambique as well as colonial mission, district administrator, and company reports serve as the basis of much of the information provided for the earlier years. The depth of coverage varies for the 1975-1991 due to the inability of the author to access relevant primary sources. In addition, several key informants remained silent on the same time period. The second portion of *Peoples' Spaces and State Spaces* explores the ways in which democratic spaces are created. It is built upon information gleaned through oral histories and field research using appraisal techniques. The main argument of the book is the need to bring rural Mozambicans into political and economic decision-making. The author argues that local people should do their own planning and then approach development agencies for funding. The author is critical of the current procedures in which outsiders merely consult local people and then chose which of a community's priorities will be addressed and when. Galli concludes that there is a need for extensive retraining of state officials and that the lowest level state officials are the most receptive to more democratic planning processes.

The book is akin to two monographs bound together: the first section is of interest to historians, anthropologists, and others working on issues of history of trade, migration, and family life. The second, resembling field reports with descriptions of individual buildings and fields is useful to the World Bank and NGO staff. The book hangs together well enough but may not have a wide audience. Graduate students and specialists will find the book useful for its contributions to the study of an African country for which there are few detailed field studies. The value of the book's contributions may be better appreciated after more details from the years 1975 – 1991 become available. Additional information on land tenure is needed. For example, questions such as where were unconsolidated holdings most common, whether trees could be

mortgaged and by whom, the ways in which squatters gained rights over time and how this might have differed by place of origin, ethnicity, gender or other factors might have been addressed. No information is provided on use and management of the marine environment. The duties of various levels of local authority are detailed but how governance is negotiated in rural Mozambique and how has this changed over time is less clear. Questions left unanswered include what opportunities existed for rural people to sit on and participate in governing boards and councils and how is voting undertaken within regional governing bodies and more generally.

The author draws on the work of James C. Scott, Judith Tandler, and Antonio Gramsci to argue that if rural people were able to directly elect district and sub-district level officials they would be put on more equal footing with urban people, but little connection is made between Mozambique and other African countries in terms of placing the country in a broader context of Portuguese holdings, frontline states, or southern Africa more generally. There is also surprisingly little discussion of the literature on space, place, and identity, which would have strengthened the analytical points made in the book.

Heidi Glaesel Frontani  
*Elon University*